

**TRANSLATION**

**PATENT COOPERATION TREATY**

**PCT**

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY**

(Chapter II of the Patent Cooperation Treaty)

(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

Applicant's or agent's file reference <b>63272</b>	<b>FOR FURTHER ACTION</b>	See Form PCT/IPEA/416
International application No. <b>PCT/EP2004/053362</b>	International filing date ( <i>day/month/year</i> ) <b>09.12.2004</b>	Priority date ( <i>day/month/year</i> ) <b>16.12.2003</b>
International Patent Classification (IPC) or national classification and IPC <b>G06F9/44</b>		
Applicant <b>THALES</b>		

1. This report is the international preliminary examination report, established by this International Preliminary Examining Authority under Article 35 and transmitted to the applicant according to Article 36.
2. This REPORT consists of a total of <u>4</u> sheets, including this cover sheet.
3. This report is also accompanied by ANNEXES, comprising: a. <input type="checkbox"/> ( <i>sent to the applicant and to the International Bureau</i> ) a total of _____ sheets, as follows: <input type="checkbox"/> sheets of the description, claims and/or drawings which have been amended and are the basis for this report and/or sheets containing rectifications authorized by this Authority (see Rule 70.16 and Section 607 of the Administrative Instructions). <input type="checkbox"/> sheets which supersede earlier sheets, but which this Authority considers contain an amendment that goes beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed, as indicated in item 4 of Box No. I and the Supplemental Box. b. <input type="checkbox"/> ( <i>sent to the International Bureau only</i> ) a total of (indicate type and number of electronic carrier(s)) _____, containing a sequence listing and/or tables related thereto, in computer readable form only, as indicated in the Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing (see Section 802 of the Administrative Instructions).
4. This report contains indications relating to the following items: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. I Basis of the report <input type="checkbox"/> Box No. II Priority <input type="checkbox"/> Box No. III Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability <input type="checkbox"/> Box No. IV Lack of unity of invention <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. V Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement <input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VI Certain documents cited <input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VII Certain defects in the international application <input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VIII Certain observations on the international application

Date of submission of the demand	Date of completion of this report
Name and mailing address of the IPEA/EP	Authorized officer
Facsimile No.	Telephone No.

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.

PCT/EP2004/053362

## Box No. I Basis of the report

1. With regard to the **language**, this report is based on the international application in the language in which it was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.
- ☐ This report is based on translations from the original language into the following language \_\_\_\_\_, which is the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of:
- ☐ international search (Rule 12.3 and 23.1(b))
- ☐ publication of the international application (Rule 12.4)
- ☐ international preliminary examination (Rule 55.2 and/or 55.3)
2. With regard to the **elements** of the international application, this report is based on *(replacement sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to this report)*:
- ☐ the international application as originally filed/furnished
- ☒ the description:
- pages 1-4 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished
- pages\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- pages\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- ☒ the claims:
- nos. 1-6 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished
- nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ as amended (together with any statement) under Article 19
- nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- ☒ the drawings:
- sheets 1/2, 2/2 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished
- sheets\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- sheets\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ a sequence listing and/or any related table(s) – see Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing.
3. ☐ The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:
- ☐ the description, pages \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ the claims, nos. \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ the drawings, sheets/figs \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ the sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
4. ☐ This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments annexed to this report and listed below had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed, as indicated in the Supplemental Box (Rule 70.2(c)).
- ☐ the description, pages \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ the claims, nos. \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ the drawings, sheets/figs \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ the sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
- ☐ any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_

\* If item 4 applies, some or all of those sheets may be marked "superseded."

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.

PCT/EP2004/053362

Box No. V	Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement		
1.	Statement		
	Novelty (N)	Claims <u>1-6</u>	YES
		Claims _____	NO
	Inventive step (IS)	Claims _____	YES
		Claims <u>1-6</u>	NO
	Industrial applicability (IA)	Claims <u>1-6</u>	YES
		Claims _____	NO
2.	Citations and explanations (Rule 70.7)		
1.	<p>Reference is made to the following document:</p> <p>D1: POPKIN SOFTWARE &amp; SYSTEMS, INC: "System Architect - User Guide" SYSTEM ARCHITECT DOCUMENTATION - PART NO. 2002-2 - PUBLICATION NO. 9.3209, [Online] 28 July 2003 (2003-07-28), pages C1, C2, 1-111, 1.1-1.8, 7.1-7.15, XP002291588 USA, downloaded from internet:  URL: <a href="http://www.popkin.com/customers/customer_service_center/downloads/manuals/UserGuide.pdf">http://www.popkin.com/customers/customer_service_center/downloads/manuals/UserGuide.pdf</a>  [downloaded 2004-08-06]</p>		
2.	<p>The present application fails to meet the requirements of PCT Article 33(1), since the subject matter of claim 1 does not involve an inventive step as defined by PCT Article 33(3).</p>		
2.1	<p>D1 is considered to be the prior art closest to the subject matter of claim 1 and, in so far as the technical features of said claim can be identified, it discloses the following features (the references that apply to said document and the terminology used therein are indicated between parentheses).</p> <p><i>A UML-model-based requirements traceability method (using the UML modelling tool System Architect for tracking requirements during the design life cycle of a project) (pages 1.1, 7.1), characterised in that</i></p>		

Box No. V	Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement
	<p><i>during modelling, a graphic interface is used when an element of a model is created, a requirement is placed on said element in said interface and the upstream requirement that initiated the creation of said element is systematically noted thereon (a built-in tracking facility enables requirement-type definitions to be assigned to symbols in models and to be cross-referenced with them) (pages 7.2, 7.10, 7.13; figures 7.1, 7.2).</i></p> <p>2.2    The subject matter of claim 1 therefore differs from the method disclosed by D1 in that: <i>a requirement is immediately placed on said element.</i></p> <p>2.3    However, linking the requirement to an element of the model when the element is created cannot be considered to involve an inventive step, since said feature is merely one of several obvious options that a person skilled in the art might select, depending on each particular case.</p> <p>2.4    Consequently, the subject matter of claim 1 does not involve an inventive step (PCT Article 33(3)).</p> <p>2.5    With regard to dependent claims 2 to 6, either the additional features contained therein are anticipated by D1, or the inclusion of said features would be obvious to a person skilled in the art, taking into account his or her general knowledge or the other documents cited in the international search report. Consequently, the subject matter of claims 2 to 6 is either not novel (PCT Article 33(2)) or not inventive (PCT Article 33(3)).</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Andrea Carciofi (Examiner)</p>